

Instructions: Complete the preference ballot counts in the table below. Then use the numbers you come up with to count the ballot by each of the 4 methods we learned in class, and extend the rankings in each method. Then recast the ballot in a way that satisfied the conditions for the monotonicity criterion and see if you can get a violation. Finally, using the voting off method described in a handout to count the ballot and look for fairness violations in that method.

# of Voters	21	20	15	5	5
1 st choice	A	B	D	B	D
2 nd choice	C	D	C	A	C
3 rd choice	D	C	A	D	B
4 th choice	B	A	B	C	A

a) Plurality

$A=21$ #2 $B=25$ #1 $D=20$ #3 $C=5$ #4

B wins
Condorcet violator

b) w/elimination

$A=21$ $B=25$ ~~$C=5$~~ #4 ~~$D=20$~~ #3
 $A=21+15$ $B=25+5$ #2 A wins

34 majority
IIA violation
in plurality aff

c) A-B

$21+15$ vs. $20+5+5$ A

A - 1 #3

pairwise

A-C

$21+5$ vs. $20+15+5$ C

B - #4

A-D

$21+5$ vs. $20+15+5$ D

C - 11 #2

B-C

$20+5$ vs. $21+15+5$ C

D - 111 ← D wins

B-D

$20+5$ vs. $21+15+5$ D

C-D

21 vs. $20+15+5+5$ D

d) Borda count

$A = 4(21) + 1(20) + 2(15) + 3(5) + 1(5) = 154$ #3

$B = 1(21) + 4(20) + 1(15) + 4(5) + 2(5) = 146$ #4

$C = 3(21) + 2(20) + 3(15) + 1(5) + 3(5) = 168$ #2

$D = 2(21) + 3(20) + 4(15) + 2(5) + 4(5) = 192$ ← D wins

of Voters

# of Voters	21	20	15	5	5
1 st choice	A	B	D	B	C
2 nd choice	C	D	C	A	D
3 rd choice	D	C	A	D	B
4 th choice	B	A	B	C	A

a) Plurality

$A=21$ #2 $B=25$ #1 $C=5$ #4 $D=15$ #3

B wins

b) w/elimination

$A=21$ $B=25$ $D=20$ #3 $C=5$ #4
 $A=36$ $B=30$ #2

A wins

c) pairwise

A-B $21+15$ vs. $20+5+5$ A

B-C $20+5$ vs. $21+15+5$ C

A - 1 #3

A-C $21+5$ vs. $20+15+5$ C

B-D $20+5$ vs. $21+15+5$ D

B - #4

A-D $21+5$ vs. $20+15+5$ D

C-D $21+5$ vs. $20+15+5$ D

C - 11 #2

D - 111 ← D wins

d) Borda count

$A = 4(21) + 1(20) + 2(15) + 3(5) + 1(5) = 154$ #3

$B = 1(21) + 4(20) + 1(15) + 4(5) + 2(5) = 146$ #4

$C = 3(21) + 2(20) + 3(15) + 1(5) + 4(5) = 173$ #2

$D = 2(21) + 3(20) + 4(15) + 2(5) + 3(5) = 187$ ← D wins

Change in vote did not produce a monotonicity violation all voters the same

least favourites

1st $A = 20 + 5 = 25$ $B = 21 + 15 = 36$ $C = 5$ $D = 0$

B is least favourite \rightarrow eliminate B

2nd $A = 20 + 15 + 5 = 40$

$C = 5$ $D = 21$
A is now least favourite \rightarrow eliminate A

3rd $C = 20 + 15 + 5 + 5 = 45$ $D = 21$

C is least favourite \rightarrow D wins

no violations this time

2nd version only last step changes to

$C = 20 + 15 + 5 = 40$ $D = 21 + 5 = 26$

C is least favourite \rightarrow D wins

no violations this time